United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit



APPELLANT'S SUPPLEMENTAL APPENDIX

76-6163

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

SANTIAGO, GREGORY R.

Plaintiff,

-against-

SECRETARY OF THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION AND WELFARE OF THE UNITED STATES,

Defendant.

SUPPLEMENTARY APPENDIX
OPINION OF THE DISTRICT COURT

JOHN C. GRAY, JR.
GRETCHEN L. SPRAGUE, Of Counsel
Brooklyn Legal Services Corp. B
152 Court Street
Brooklyn, New York 11201
(212) 855-8003

Attorney for Appellant



UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

Plaintiff,

Docket No. 76-6163

-against-

SANTIAGO, GREGORY R.

SECRETARY OF THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION AND WELFARE OF THE UNITED STATES,

Defendant.

SUPPLEMENTARY APPENDIX OPINION OF THE DISTRICT COURT

JOHN C. GRAY, JR.
GRETCHEN L. SPRAGUE, Of Counsel
Brooklyn Legal Services Corp. B
152 Court Street
Brooklyn, New York 11201
(212) 855-8003

Attorney for Appellant

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

GREGORY ROMAN-SANTIAGO,

Plaintiff,

76 C 2129

-against-

DAVID MATHEWS, Secretary of Health, Education and Welfare,

Defendant.

Appearances:

GRETCHEN L. SPRAGUE, Esq. (JOHN C. GRAY, JR., Esq. Brooklyn Legal Services Corp.) of Counsel for plaintiff

MICHAEL G. CAVANAGH, Esq. (DAVID G. TRAGER, Esq., United States Attorney) of Counsel for defendant DOOLING, D.J.

It is not possible to set aside the Secretary's determination that plaintiff was not under a disability within the meaning of the statute (42 U.S.C. 423(d)). As often in cases in which a party complains of a back injury, there were no objective symptoms of moment, and medical testing and examination failed to portray more than partial impairment of work capacity.

The substantial question is whether the Administrative

Law Judge was able to function fairly and effectively when he

had to deal with a layman and with a language barrier of uncertain sort. It must be concluded that he was able to and did act fairly and effectively. He secured an interpreter of whom plaintiff did not complain. He gave plaintiff time to obtain a lawyer and plaintiff was unable to do so. The Administrative Law Judge then went ahead, and, particularly in his questioning of the vocational expert, showed manifest willingness and ability to sort out the facts. It is difficult to see how, on the record, he could have decided in plaintiff's favor.

Judge explained that he might well decide against plaintiff, and he explained to plaintiff that with additional or supplemental medical evidence he could apply afresh to show that he came under a disability at any time through September 30, 1975, (four and a half months after the close of the hearing).

It is concluded that the Secretary's determination must be affirmed. It is

ORDERED that defendant's motion for judgment is granted and plaintiff's motion for judgment is denied and the Clerk is directed to enter judgment that plaintiff take nothing and

that the action is dismissed on the merits.

Brooklyn, New York

Ocdober 6, 1976.__

10. VJ.16

AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE BY MAIL

STATE OF NEW YORK SS.: COUNTY OF KINGS

being duly sworn, deposes Gretchen L. Sprague, and says:

That deponent is not a party to the action, is over 18 years of age and resides at 1150 East 29th Street, Brooklyn,

New York.

That on the 14th day of December , 1976, deponent served the within

Supplementary Appendix, Opinion of the District Court each addressee listed below, being the address designated by said Attorney for that purpose, by depositing a true copy of same enclosed in a postpaid properly addressed wrapper, in an official depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Post Office Department within New York State, addressed to:

Michael Cavanagh, Esq. Assistant United States Attorney Eastern District of New York 225 Cadman Plaza East Brooklyn, New York 11201

Gretchen L. Spragu

Gretchen J

14th day of December , 1976

V. YVONNE LEWIS Notary Public, State of New York
No. 31-4518340

Oualified in New York County
Commission Expires March 30, 197.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Sworn to before me this